Planning Committee 09 December 2020 Item 3 f

Application Number: 20/11087 Full Planning Permission

Site: READS FARMHOUSE, MARTIN ROAD, MARTIN SP6 3LN

Development: Single-storey hardwood orangery to side elevation

Applicant: Mr & Mrs Fernie

Agent: GDG

Target Date: 30/11/2020

Case Officer: Kate Cattermole

Extension Date: 11/12/2020

1 SUMMARY OF THE MAIN ISSUES

The key issues are:

- 1) Impact on the character and appearance of the Listed Building and Conservation Area
- 2) Impact on the Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty

This application is to be considered by Committee because there is a contrary view with Cllr Edward Heron

2 SITE DESCRIPTION

Read's Farmhouse is a Grade II listed building, situated in the historic core of the rural village of Martin. The site falls within the Martin Conservation Area, and is also within the Cranborne Chase Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty (AONB) and International Dark Skies Reserve. The site is also flanked by Listed Buildings; the Manor House is a Grade II* Listed Building.

The dwelling sits within a large plot with other listed outbuildings to the back of the main building, the garden area being to the south and rear of the house with a wall along the front boundary to screen views from the road.

3 PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT

The application proposes the erection of an orangery to be positioned on the side of the earlier rear extension, facing the garden. Amended plans were accepted, to correct an inaccuracy on the plans.

4 PLANNING HISTORY

Proposal	Decision Date	Decision Description	Status
20/11088 Single storey hardwood orangery to side elevation (Listed Building application)			Current application See item 3g on this Agenda

07/91385 Single-storey rear extension 22/01/2008 Granted Subject Decided to Conditions

07/91386 22/01/2008 Granted subject Decided Single storey rear extension: french doors: to conditions

Single storey rear extension; french doors; replacement windows and velux; cast iron

airbricks; internal alterations

86/NFDC/33351/LBC Two-storey rear 03/02/1987 Granted Subject Decided

addition. to Conditions

86/NFDC/30620/LBC 17/07/1986 Granted subject Decided

Internal alterations and repairs, to conditions

reconstruction of roof structure, re tiling, construction of canopy porch and demolition of attached single storey outbuildings and existing porch and erection of a two storey rear extension and reinstatement of boundary walls.

5 PLANNING POLICY AND GUIDANCE

Local Plan Part 1: Planning Strategy

Policy ENV3: Design quality and local distinctiveness

Policy ENV4: Landscape character and quality Policy STR1: Achieving Sustainable Development

Policy STR2: Protection of the countryside, Cranborne Chase Area of Outstanding

Natural Beauty and the adjoining New Forest National Park

<u>Local Plan Part 2 Sites and Development Management Development Plan Document</u>

DM1: Heritage and Conservation

DM20: Residential development in the countryside

Supplementary Planning Documents

Martin Character Statement

SPG - Conservatory Design Guide

SPG - Residential Design Guide for Rural Areas

Cranborne Chase AONB Management Plan

Landscape Character Assessment

National Planning Policy Framework

NPPF Ch.12 - Achieving well-designed places

NPPF Ch.16 - Conserving and enhancing the historic environment

6 PARISH / TOWN COUNCIL COMMENTS

Martin Parish Council

The proposed development seems a reasonable and proportionate addition to the property. Martin Parish Council therefore recommend PERMISSION, for the reasons listed, but would accept the decision reached by the District Council Officers under their delegated powers (PAR 1)

7 COUNCILLOR COMMENTS

Clir Edward J Heron

I wish to register my **support** for the above application

The proposed Orangery is a sympathetic and subservient addition to this Listed Farmhouse. The proposed material and finishes are appropriate and in keeping with the existing property. I have noted the comments of the Conservation Officer but am of the view that the proposed addition does less than substantial harm to the property and by maintaining the functionality of the dwelling in a form that is appropriate for modern living secures its optimum viable use.

8 CONSULTEE COMMENTS

Comments have been received from the following consultees:

Environmental Health Contaminated Land: no concerns

Cranborne Chase & West Wiltshire Downs AONB: proposed roof lantern unacceptable, as scope for light pollution is considerable.

Archaeologist: no objection subject to condition

Conservation: objection

9 REPRESENTATIONS RECEIVED

None received

10 PLANNING ASSESSMENT

Principle of Development

This property is located within the countryside where Policy DM20 of the Local Plan Part 2 is relevant. This policy only permits limited extensions to existing dwellings that are of an appropriate design, scale and appearance in keeping with the rural character of the area. This policy includes a quantitative measure whereby extensions should not normally provide an increase in floorspace of more than 30%. In all cases proposals should be designed to respect the character and scale of the existing dwelling and not significantly alter the impact of built development on the site within its setting.

Flexibility is applied to the additions of conservatories and supporting text to the policy defines the proportion of glazing to walls and roof for a proposal to be considered as such. Even though the extension is described as an orangery, it meets the criteria of a conservatory in respect of this definition. However in respect of the character and scale of the existing building, this proposal has to be considered in relation its impact on the existing dwelling and the rural character of the area as well as the character and appearance of the Conservation Area and Listed Building.

Impact on the character and appearance of the Listed Building and Conservation Area

There is a duty imposed by Section 66(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 requiring decision makers to have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses. Section 72(1) also requires special regard to be paid to preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of a conservation area.

The National Planning Policy Framework 2019 (NPPF) makes clear that when considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the asset's conservation.

Extensions to a Listed Building should not compromise the appearance or the integrity of the building. The historic part of the dwelling is a linear building sited close to the road frontage; it is a narrow building with simple roof form and gables on the side elevations, being of 2 storey and single storey. The later additions to the dwelling - which are two and single storey in form - are to the rear and do not detract from the linear form of the historic building. The two storey element is of similar materials, and reflects the fenestration of the listed building, being primarily casement windows, whilst the later single storey addition is timber clad. These extensions form natural linear additions to the Listed Building projecting into the plot, and do not detract from the character and appearance of the historic core of the dwelling.

The proposed orangery would be sited off the side wall of the 1980s extension, so would not interfere with the historic fabric of the building. However, these later extensions do form part of the Listed Building and any alterations and additions to them would have an impact on the significance of the Listed Building and its contribution to the Conservation Area. The proposed orangery should respect the property's scale, and reflect the proportions and strengths of the building as well as being the correct style for the period of the building. The accompanying Heritage Statement does not provide any design analysis of the building, nor is any justification provided as to the siting or design of the proposed orangery.

The boxy form of the proposed orangery, its position on the side elevation and its projection beyond the side of the historic core of the building do not appear as a natural addition to the house, instead competing with this side of the house and the general arrangement of the building. Furthermore, views of the top of the extension would be visible from public vantage points over the front wall.

The design of the proposed orangery would contrast with the simple form of the existing building, introducing a formal structure that would not respect any of the features of the existing building. It would appear an incongruous addition projecting out to the side of the building with a dominant roof lantern, which would be visible within the conservation area. As such it would detract from and be harmful to the proportions of the existing building and have an unacceptable impact on the conservation area.

Para 196 of the National Planning Policy Framework states that when less than substantial harm to the significance of the heritage asset has been identified, then this harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal including, where appropriate, securing its optimum viable use.

The Listed Building was purportedly in severe disrepair when it was rescued in the 1980s. The extensions to the dwelling allowed for a sustainable residential dwelling which is now well maintained and is a 4 bedroom dwelling with a large kitchen, living room, dining room and snug. The proposed orangery would provide additional accommodation that would enhance the living arrangements for the occupier, however this would not outweigh the identified harm caused to the Listed Building and Martin Conservation Area set out in the provisions of the NPPF Para 196

Impact on the Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty

Para 172 of the National Planning Policy Framework states that great weight should be given to conserving and enhancing landscape and scenic beauty in Areas of Outstanding Beauty. By reason of their siting in the plot, design and dimensions, the proposed extensions would not detract from the landscape setting of the AONB, nor be harmful to the Dark Skies Reserve.

In 2019 the Cranborne Chase AONB was designated the 14th International Dark Sky Reserve in the world, and hence the visibility of stars is a key attribute to the AONB. The site is within a rural area where levels of light pollution are minimal. Albeit that this is a residential dwelling with windows and doors on the side elevation facing the garden, by reason of the extent of glazing both in the walls and roof of the proposed orangery it would have the potential to create excessive additional light pollution within this part of the site. The requirement to provide internal blinds to limit light in order to mitigate this harm would not be a reasonable or enforceable planning condition. As such due to the level of glazing proposed in the orangery there would be additional light pollution leading to unacceptable harm to the AONB contrary to national and local policies, which recognize the importance and maintaining of the Dark Skies Reserve.

<u>Archaeology</u>

The application site falls within an area identified as having archaeological significance and has added importance being in close proximity to historic Listed Buildings. As such archaeological investigations would be a requirement of any ground breaking work on this site. Even though no archaeological assessment has been submitted in conjunction with this application, these works could be secured by condition prior to development commencing and as such it would not be reasonable to refuse the development on these grounds.

Neighbour amenity

By reason of its siting and relationship with the neighbouring property, Garretts Farmhouse, there would be no adverse impact upon neighbour amenity.

11 CONCLUSION

The proposals have been considered within the relevant local and national policy context. The proposed development would result in harmful additions to the Listed Building which would consequently detract from the character and appearance of the Martin Conservation Area.

Notwithstanding there is no impact upon neighbour amenity, the harm to the Listed Building and Conservation Area, outweighs the individual benefits to the applicant. Refusal is therefore recommended.

12 OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

None

13 RECOMMENDATION

Refuse

Reason(s) for Refusal:

- 1. By reason of its siting, design and height, the proposed orangery would be an incongruous addition that would detract from the simple form of the Listed Building, and as such would be harmful to both the character and appearance of the Listed Building and Martin Conservation Area leading to less than substantial harm to the heritage assets. There are no identified public benefits to outweigh such harm. Furthermore, by reason of its design incorporating a large degree of glazing, the proposed orangery would create an unacceptable level of light pollution that would be harmful to the designated Dark Skies Reserve in the Cranborne Chase Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty. Therefore the proposed development would be contrary to Policies ENV3, and ENV4 of the Local Plan Part 1 Planning Strategy and DM1 of the Local Plan Part 2: sites and Development Management Plan, and Chaps 12, and 16 of the National Planning Policy Framework.
- 2. By reason of its design incorporating a large degree of glazing, the proposed orangery would create an unacceptable level of light pollution that would be harmful to the designated Dark Skies Reserve in the Cranborne Chase Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty. Therefore the proposed development would be contrary to Policies ENV3, ENV4, and STR2 of the Local Plan Part 1 Planning Strategy and DM1 of the Local Plan Part 2: sites and Development Management Plan, and Chaps 12, 15 and 16 of the National Planning Policy Framework.

Further Information:

Kate Cattermole

Telephone: 023 8028 5446

